



Meeting Summary

Client: **NYCDOT**
Project Name: **ESA-Transportation Planning**
Location: **Chinatown, NY**
Project Number: **10312404**
Issue Date: **6 DEC 2011**

TO: **Nathan Gray, NYCDOT**

FROM: **Patrick Jordan, Zetlin**

RE: **Community Advisory Committee Meeting #2**

Project **Chinatown Curbside Management Study**

NYCDOT – ESA: Transportation Planning, Transportation Engineering, Urban Design and Related Services, Citywide. PIN: 84107MBTR187

Executive Summary

On October 13, 2011, the New York City Department of Transportation (NYCDOT) held the second Community Advisory Committee (CAC) Meeting for the Chinatown Curbside Management Study in the offices of Chinese Consolidated Benevolent Association (CCBA), 62 Mott Street, New York, New York. The meeting was attended by 11 members of the CAC.

The purpose of the meeting was to introduce the pilot blockfaces and the proposed toolbox of solutions. In a PowerPoint presentation (available at on-line portal at <http://nyc.gov/dot/projects/chinatown-curbside-management>) Suchi Sanagavarapu, NYCDOT, presented an overview of the project, a summary of the information collected to date through technical review, and public involvement efforts. The presentation offered examples of potential solutions. Lastly, a timeline of events through the completion of the study was provided to the CAC as a reference.

After the presentation, members broke out into two groups to participate in a board game activity that focused on using the proposed toolbox of solutions to solve real world issues that were identified through the previous public involvement activities. The goal of the board game activity was to work as a team to develop consensus on proposed solutions working from one issue to the next through the game board.

Throughout the eight issue blocks, the two groups had similar solutions for issues. Both tables felt that *Sidewalk Garbage Control and Modifications to Pedestrian Space* were solutions to ‘Sidewalk Obstructions and Pedestrian Congestion’. Concerning ‘Lack of On-Street Parking’, both tables agreed that *Parking Regulation Changes* was a workable solution.

Since neither table was able to complete all eight blocks in the allotted time, the game activity will be shortened for future outreach activities. This will also reduce redundancy.

Following is a summary of the board game activity:

Block 1: Double Parking – Cars & Trucks

- Table 1:
 - Solution: *Commercial Delivery Windows*
 - Advantage: Reduces double parking
 - Disadvantages: Difficulty reaching consensus on times; enforcement will be difficult
 - Discussion: Would charging for deliveries be effective; people would not pay

- Table 2:
 - Solutions: *Paid Commercial Delivery Zones; Parking Regulation Changes*
 - Advantages: Allows more space for parking; match parking policies with use
 - Disadvantages: Lack of enforcement of policy; maybe Chinatown has too much enforcement; businesses resistant; possible increased cost to businesses; more people driving around streets looking for parking

Block 2: Sidewalk Obstructions and Pedestrian Congestion

- Table 1:
 - Solutions: *Sidewalk Garbage Control; Parking Regulation Changes; Modifications to Pedestrian Space*
 - Advantages: Less congestions; control parking better
 - Disadvantage: Possible lack of community support for modifications
 - Discussion: Merchants would oppose closing streets to allow for pedestrian areas at first, but would come around when they saw the benefits to their businesses (specific locations – East Broadway, Pell Street, and Doyer Street)

- Table 2:
 - Solutions: *Sidewalk Garbage Control; Modifications to Pedestrian Space*
 - Advantages: More garbage cans to hold trash; improves pedestrian safety; increases public space; better balance of the needs of pedestrians and vendors
 - Disadvantages: Who will collect garbage; decreasing space for cars and parking
 - Discussion: Pedestrian malls – economically vibrant, but remove parking

Block 3: Lack of On-Street Parking

- Table 1:
 - Solutions: *Commercial Delivery Zones; Parking Regulations Changes; Sign Unification/Clarification*
 - Advantages: Commercial delivery zones will help free up on-street parking during peak periods; parking garages would help as well
 - Disadvantage: Current lack of parking forces some to use commuter vans, so less not more parking is needed
 - Discussion: Need more off-street parking options, but done by NYCDOT – cheaper municipal parking rather than expensive private parking

- Table 2:
 - Solution: *Parking Regulations Changes*
 - Advantage: Policies that better match demand for parking spaces
 - Disadvantage: Less parking turnover – people will not move
 - Discussion: What would new regulations be; tickets are too expensive and a deterrent to customers to return

Block 4: Parking Regulations

- Table 1:
 - Solutions: *Parking Regulations Changes*; Strict enforcement of double parking
 - Advantage: Matching use and demand important
 - Disadvantage: Does not matter without enforcement
 - Discussion: Meters should be active on Sundays; community divide on purpose of parking; restaurant areas should have two hour parking
- Table 2:
 - Discussed in tandem with Block 3

Block 5: Competing Uses for Narrow Streets

- Table 1:
 - Solutions: *Sidewalk Garbage Control; Modification of Pedestrian Space; Commercial Delivery Windows*
 - Discussion: You have to take away parking on these streets; some streets so small they actually hinder traffic flow; enforcement against illegal vendors; dedicated vendor space would be ideal.
- Table 2:
 - No discussion – due to time constraints

Block 6: Intercity Buses and Commuter Van Issues

- Table 1:
 - Solutions: *Parking Regulation Changes; Modifications to Pedestrian Space; Sidewalk Garbage Control*
 - Discussion: Patrons of buses liter; all tools will help this; metered bus parking would prevent idling; move vans closer to bridge and away from parks; shuttle from parking areas to central business area
- Table 2:
 - Solution: Get a bus depot
 - Advantage: Gets people and business to Chinatown
 - Disadvantage: A lot of narrow streets make a suitable destination hard to find; increase in bus traffic; if too far away buses will not use

Block 7: Quality of Life

- Neither table discussed due to time constraints.

Block 8: Intercity Buses and Commuter Van Issues

- Table 1:
 - Solutions: *Modifications to Pedestrian Space; Sidewalk Garbage Control*
 - Advantage: Vendors are important to Chinatown
 - Disadvantages: Moving vendors off the curb into the street could remove parking from Canal Street
- Table 2:
 - Solution: Extend the curb and move vendors into parking lane
 - Advantages: More room for vendors and more room for pedestrians
 - Disadvantages: Safety issues; who will be partner